arXiv:1210.7207v4 [math-ph] 11 Feb 2013

Does Elko Spinor Field Imply the Existence of an Axis of Locality?

Edmundo Capelas de Oliveira and Waldyr Alves Rodrigues Jr.
Institute of Mathematics, Statistics and Scientific Computation
IMECC-UNICAMP
13083-859 Campinas SP, Brazil
capelas@ime.unicamp.br and walrod@ime.unicamp.br

February 13, 2014

Abstract

In this paper we show that the statement in reference Ahluwalia, Lee, and Schritt (2011) that the existence of elko spinor fields implies in an *axis of locality* is equivocated. The anticommutator $\{\Lambda(\mathbf{x},t), \Pi(\mathbf{x},t\}$ is strictly local.

1 The Integral Appearing in the Propagator

In [1] authors calculated the propagator for an elko spinor field supposed to satisfy the Klein-Gordon equation in Minkowski spacetime. They obtained a sum of two terms, the first being the usual propagator (fundamental solution) for a Klein-Gordon field and the second involves evaluation of the integral (see their Eq.(6.20))

$$\int \frac{d^4p}{(2\pi)^4} e^{-ip_\mu(x'^\mu - x^\mu)} \frac{i\varpi}{p_\mu p^\mu - m^2 + i\varepsilon} \mathcal{G}(\mathbf{p}). \quad (1)$$

The calculation is done in an inertial reference frame[1] $\mathbf{e}_0 = \partial/\partial t$ with arbitrary spatial axes $\langle \mathbf{e}_1 = \frac{\partial}{\partial x}, \mathbf{e}_2 = \frac{\partial}{\partial y}, \mathbf{e}_3 = \frac{\partial}{\partial z} \rangle$ chosen in such a way that together with $\mathbf{e}_0$ defines a global orthonormal tetrad in Minkoswki spacetime. We next introduce spherical coordinates associated with the selected orthonormal triad $\langle \mathbf{e}_1, \mathbf{e}_2, \mathbf{e}_3 \rangle$ and write

$$\mathbf{p} = (r\sin\theta\cos\varphi, r\sin\theta\sin\varphi, r\cos\theta).$$

Then[2]

$$\mathcal{G}(\mathbf{p}) := \gamma^5\gamma^\mu n_\mu, \quad (2)$$

where the spacelike vector field $n = n^\mu \mathbf{e}_\mu$ is

$$n_\mu := (0, \mathbf{n}), \quad \mathbf{n} := \frac{1}{\sin\theta}\frac{\partial}{\partial\varphi}\left(\frac{\mathbf{p}}{|\mathbf{p}|}\right) = (-\sin\varphi, \cos\varphi, 0)$$

Then the authors claim:

> If there is no preferred direction, and since we are integrating over all momenta, we are free to choose a coordinate system in which $\mathbf{x}' - \mathbf{x}$ lies in the $\hat{z}$ direction. In this special case, the $\mathbf{p}\cdot(\mathbf{x}'-\mathbf{x})$ depends only on $p(=|\mathbf{p}|)$ and θ, but not on φ. Thus, the only φ-dependence in the whole integrand comes from $\mathcal{G}$ which depends on φ in such a manner that an integral over one period vanishes.

Remark 1 *It is very important to remark that if this integral would result non null the fundamental solution for the Klein-Gordon operator would have an additional term, something that obviously cannot be the case.*

[1] In Relativity theory reference frames are represented by timelike vector fields $\mathbf{Z}$ on the manifold modelling spacetime. In Special Relativity if D is the Levi-Civita connection of the Minkowski metric η, an inertial frame is a timelike vector field $\mathbf{I}$ such that $D\mathbf{I} = 0$. Details can be found, e.g., in [4, 5].

[2] See also Eq.(31) in [2].

2 The Integral of $\mathcal{G}(\mathbf{p})$

On the other hand in [2] authors calculated the anti-commutator of an elko spinor field with its canonical momentum getting their Eq.(42), i.e.,

$$\{\Lambda(\mathbf{x},t),\Pi(\mathbf{x},t\} = i\delta(\mathbf{x}-\mathbf{x}')\mathbb{I} + i\int \frac{d^3p}{(2\pi)^3}e^{i\mathbf{p}\cdot(\mathbf{x}-\mathbf{x}')}\mathcal{G}(\mathbf{p}) \tag{3}$$

There they claim:

> "Since the integral on the right hand side of Eq.(42) vanishes only along the $\pm\hat{z}_e$ axis, the preferred axis also becomes the axis of locality".

Let us examine if that claim is correct. Call $|\mathbf{x}-\mathbf{x}'| = \Delta$, and put

$$(\mathbf{x}-\mathbf{x}') = \Delta(\sin\theta_\Delta\cos\varphi_\Delta, \sin\theta_\Delta\sin\varphi_\Delta, \cos\theta_\Delta). \tag{4}$$

Calculation of the integral in the second member of Eq.(3) resumes in the calculation of the following integrals [3]

$$\mathbf{J}(\Delta) = \int_0^\infty dr r^2\int_0^\pi d\theta\sin\theta\int_0^{2\pi}d\varphi e^{ir\Delta f(\theta,\theta_\Delta,\varphi,\varphi_\Delta)}\sin\varphi, \tag{5}$$

and

$$\mathbf{K}(\Delta) = \int_0^\infty dr r^2\int_0^\pi d\theta\sin\theta\int_0^{2\pi}d\varphi e^{ir\Delta f(\theta,\theta_\Delta,\varphi,\varphi_\Delta)}\cos\varphi, \tag{6}$$

with $f(\theta,\theta_\Delta,\varphi,\varphi_\Delta) = \sin\theta\cos\varphi\sin\theta_\Delta\cos\varphi_\Delta + \sin\theta\sin\varphi\sin\theta_\Delta\sin\varphi_\Delta + \cos\theta\cos\theta_\Delta$.

We will now calculate the integrals in Eqs.(5) and (6) in the cases when $\mathbf{x}-\mathbf{x}'$ lies respectively in the $\mathbf{e}_1$, $\mathbf{e}_2$ and $\mathbf{e}_3$ directions. We will call the respective integrals $\mathbf{J}_i(\Delta)$ and $\mathbf{K}_i(\Delta)$, for $i = 1,2,3$.

We start with the observation that it is trivial to verify that $\mathbf{J}_3(\Delta) = 0$ and $\mathbf{K}_3(\Delta) = 0$. To continue we calculate $\mathbf{J}_2(\Delta)$.

So, let us choose the spatial axis such that $(\mathbf{x}-\mathbf{x}') = \Delta\mathbf{e}_2 = \Delta(0,1,0)$ and perform the non-trivial exercise of calculating the value of the integral given by Eq.(5) in this case, i.e.,

$$\mathbf{J}_2(\Delta) = \int_0^\infty dr r^2\int_0^\pi d\theta\sin\theta\int_0^{2\pi}d\varphi\sin\varphi e^{ir\Delta\sin\theta\sin\varphi}. \tag{7}$$

[3] We take $\Delta \neq 0$. For $\Delta = 0$ it is obvious that $\mathbf{J}(0) = \mathbf{K}(0) = 0$.

We start evaluating the φ-integral,

$$\mathbf{\Omega}(\xi) = \int_0^{2\pi}d\varphi\sin\varphi e^{i\xi\sin\varphi}, \tag{8}$$

where $\xi := r\Delta\sin\theta$. Observe that $\Omega(\xi) = d\Lambda(\xi)/d\xi$ where (see 8.473-4, page 968 of [3])

$$\Lambda(\xi) = \int_0^{2\pi}d\varphi e^{i\xi\sin\varphi} = 2\int_0^\pi d\varphi\cos(r\Delta\sin\theta\sin\varphi) = 2\pi J_0(r\Delta\sin\theta), \tag{9}$$

with J_0 the zero order Bessel function. So,

$$\Omega(\xi) = 2\pi i J_1(r\Delta\sin\theta)] \tag{10}$$

where J_1 is the first order Bessel function. Next we evaluate

$$\mathbf{\Xi}(r,\Delta) = 2\pi i\int_0^\pi d\theta\sin\theta J_1(r\Delta\sin\theta). \tag{11}$$

Using the relation 6.681-8, page 739 of [3], namely

$$\int_0^\pi dx\sin(2\mu x)J_{2\nu}(2a\sin x) = \pi\sin(\mu\pi)J_{\nu-\mu}(a)J_{\nu+\mu}(a), \tag{12}$$

valid for $\mathrm{Re}(\nu) > -1$ we see that identifying $2\mu = 1$, $2\nu = 1$ and $2a = r\Delta$ we can write

$$\mathbf{\Xi}(r,\Delta) = 2\pi^2 i J_0\left(\frac{r\Delta}{2}\right)J_1\left(\frac{r\Delta}{2}\right). \tag{13}$$

So, putting $t = r\Delta/2$ we have

$$\mathbf{J}_2(\Delta) = \frac{16\pi^2 i}{\Delta^3}\int_0^\infty dt t^2 J_0(t)J_1(t). \tag{14}$$

Now, recall relation 6.626-3, page 715 of [3] (with $\beta = 1$), namely

$$\int_0^\infty dx e^{-2\alpha x}xJ_0(x)J_1(x) = \frac{1}{2\pi}\left[\frac{K\left(\frac{1}{\sqrt{1+\alpha^2}}\right) - E\left(\frac{1}{\sqrt{1+\alpha^2}}\right)}{\sqrt{1+\alpha^2}}\right]. \tag{15}$$

Then we see that

$$\mathbf{J}_2(\Delta) = -\frac{4\pi i}{\Delta^3}\lim_{\alpha\to 0}\frac{d}{d\alpha}\left[\frac{K\left(\frac{1}{\sqrt{1+\alpha^2}}\right) - E\left(\frac{1}{\sqrt{1+\alpha^2}}\right)}{\sqrt{1+\alpha^2}}\right]. \tag{16}$$

Recalling moreover relations 8.113 and 8.114, page 905 of [3] we have for the elliptic functions K and E

$$K\left(\frac{1}{\sqrt{1+\alpha^2}}\right)=\frac{\pi}{2}\ {}_1F_2\left(\frac{1}{2},\frac{1}{2};1;\frac{1}{1+\alpha^2}\right),$$
$$E\left(\frac{1}{\sqrt{1+\alpha^2}}\right)=\frac{\pi}{2}\ {}_1F_2\left(-\frac{1}{2},\frac{1}{2};1;\frac{1}{1+\alpha^2}\right) \quad (17)$$

where ${}_2F_1$ are Gauss hypergeometric functions. So,

$$\int_0^\infty dx e^{-2\alpha x}xJ_0(x)J_1(x)$$
$$=\frac{1}{4}\left[\frac{{}_2F_1\left(\frac{1}{2},\frac{1}{2};1;\frac{1}{1+\alpha^2}\right)-\ {}_2F_1\left(-\frac{1}{2},\frac{1}{2};1;\frac{1}{1+\alpha^2}\right)}{\sqrt{1+\alpha^2}}\right] \quad (18)$$

and to end our long calculation we must evaluate the limit when $a\to 0$ of

$$\frac{d}{d\alpha}\left[\frac{{}_2F_1\left(\frac{1}{2},\frac{1}{2};1;\frac{1}{1+\alpha^2}\right)-\ {}_2F_1\left(-\frac{1}{2},\frac{1}{2};1;\frac{1}{1+\alpha^2}\right)}{\sqrt{1+\alpha^2}}\right]. \quad (19)$$

Recalling moreover that (see, e.g., page 281 of [6])

$$\frac{d}{dz}\ {}_2F_1(a,b;c;z)=\frac{ab}{c}\ {}_2F_1(a+1,b+1;c+1;z),$$

and that ${}_2F_1\left(a,b;c;z\right)=\sum_{n=0}^{\infty}\frac{(a)_n(b)_n}{(c)_n}\frac{z^n}{n!}$ (with $(a)_n,(b)_n,(c)_n$ the Pochhammer symbols) we see that we are justified in writing

$$\lim_{\alpha\to 0}\frac{d}{d\alpha}\left\{\frac{{}_2F_1\left(\frac{1}{2},\frac{1}{2};1;\frac{1}{1+\alpha^2}\right)}{\sqrt{1+\alpha^2}}\right\}$$
$$=\lim_{\alpha\to 0}\left\{\begin{array}{c}-\alpha(1+\alpha^2)^{-3/2}\ {}_2F_1\left(\frac{1}{2},\frac{1}{2};1;\frac{1}{1+\alpha^2}\right)\\ -2\alpha(1+\alpha^2)^{-5/2}\ {}_2F_1'\left(\frac{1}{2},\frac{1}{2};1;\frac{1}{1+\alpha^2}\right)\end{array}\right\}=0. \quad (20)$$

Also,

$$\lim_{\alpha\to 0}\frac{d}{d\alpha}\left[(1+\alpha^2)^{-1/2}\ {}_2F_1\left(-\frac{1}{2},\frac{1}{2};1;\frac{1}{1+\alpha^2}\right)\right]=0. \quad (21)$$

Finally, using Eqs.(20) and (21) in Eq.(16) we have that $\mathbf{J}_2(\Delta)=0$.

We now evaluate

$$\mathbf{K}_2(\Delta)=\int_0^\infty drr^2\int_0^\pi d\theta\sin\theta\int_0^{2\pi}d\varphi e^{ir\Delta\sin\theta\sin\varphi}\cos\varphi. \quad (22)$$

Calling $\boldsymbol{x}=\sin\varphi$ and $r\Delta\sin\theta=\alpha$ we see that (taking into account relation 3.715-9, page 401 of [3] with $n=1$) we have

$$\int_0^{2\pi}d\varphi e^{ir\Delta\sin\theta\sin\varphi}\cos\varphi=\int_{-\pi}^{\pi}d\varphi e^{ir\Delta\sin\theta\sin\varphi}\cos\varphi$$
$$=-2\int_0^\pi d\boldsymbol{x}\cos\varphi\ \cos(\boldsymbol{x}\sin\varphi)=-2[1+(-1)]\frac{\pi}{2}J_1(\boldsymbol{x})=0 \quad (23)$$

and we conclude that $\mathbf{K}_2(\Delta)=0$.

We now evaluate $\mathbf{J}_1(\Delta)$ and $\mathbf{K}_1(\Delta)$. Observe that

$$\int_0^{2\pi}d\varphi\sin\varphi e^{ir\Delta\sin\theta\cos\varphi}=-\int_{-\pi}^{\pi}\sin\varphi e^{ir\Delta\sin\theta\cos\varphi}=0, \quad (24)$$

since the integrand is and odd function and the interval is symmetric. So, we have

$$\mathbf{J}_1(\Delta)=\int_0^\infty drr^2\int_0^\pi d\theta\sin\theta\int_0^{2\pi}d\varphi\sin\varphi e^{ir\Delta\sin\theta\cos\varphi}=0. \quad (25)$$

It remains to evaluate

$$\mathbf{K}_1(\Delta)=\int_0^\infty drr^2\int_0^\pi d\theta\sin\theta[\int_0^{2\pi}d\varphi e^{ir\Delta\sin\theta\cos\varphi}\cos\varphi] \quad (26)$$

Writing $\boldsymbol{x}=ir\Delta\sin\theta$ and changing $\varphi\mapsto\varphi+\pi$ the the integral in the brackets in Eq.(26) becomes $2\pi iJ_1(r\Delta\sin\theta)$. When this is inserted in Eq.(26) and steps analogous to the ones used in the evaluation of $\mathbf{J}_2(\Delta)$ are used we get $\mathbf{K}_1(\Delta)=0$.

3 Conclusions

We have shown through explicitly and detailed calculation that the integral of $\mathcal{G}(\mathbf{p})$ appearing in Eq.(42) of [2] is null for $\mathbf{x}-\mathbf{x}'$ lying in three orthonormal spatial directions in the rest frame of an arbitrary inertial frame $\mathbf{e}_0=\partial/\partial t$.

This shows that the existence of elko spinor fields does not implies in any breakdown of locality concerning the anticommutator of $\{\Lambda(\mathbf{x},t),\Pi(\mathbf{x}',t\}$ and moreover does not implies in any preferred spacelike direction field in Minkowski spacetime.

Acknowledgment *Authors acknowledge discussions with D. V. Ahluwalia, Roldão da Rocha Jr. and J. Vaz Jr.*

References

[1] Ahluwalia-Khalilova, D. V., and Grumiller, D., Spin-Half Fermions with Mass Dimension One: Theory, Phenomenology, and Dark Matter, *JCAP* 0507:012 (2005).

[2] Ahluwalia, D. V., Lee, C-Y., Schritt, D., Self-interacting Elko Dark Matter with an Axis of Locality, Phys. Rev. D **83,** 065017 (2011).

[3] Gradshteyn, I. S. and Ryzhik, I. M., *Table of Integrals Series and Products*, Academic Press, New York, 1965.

[4] Rodrigues, W. A. Jr., and Capelas de Oliveira, E., *The Many Faces of Maxwell, Dirac and Einstein Equations*, Lecture Notes in Physcs **722**, Springer, Heidelberg, 2007.

[5] Sachs, R. K., and Wu, H., *General Relativity for Mathematicians,* Springer, New York, 1977.

[6] Whittaker, E. T., and Watson, G. N., *A Course of Modern Analysis*, Cambridge University Press, Cambridge, (fourth edition), 1927.